

## **Anthropology & Sociology**

Academic year 2022 - 2023

## **Cultures of Expertise**

MINT 290 - Fall - 6 ECTS

## **Course Description**

Experts are a dominant force in our societies. In the last century, they even carved a place for themselves in transnational politics, a realm traditionally left to the power struggles of nation-states and empires. In this course, we will take experts, their epistemic cultures and their influence on both transnational policies and domestic societies as our focus. We will ask the following questions: How do experts construct facts? How do they distinguish themselves from non-experts? How do experts participate in democratic decision-making? How do they influence transnational policies? We will learn about different cultures of expertise in colonial times, the Cold War and the "new globalization" era; topics will range from the role of experts in the management of colonial subjects, international security dilemas, the creation and regulation of financial markets, health policies, etc. Rather than privileging one perspective on cultures of expertise, the course will draw on theoretical works from sociology, history, anthropology, and science and technology studies. Students will be encouraged to develop an original approach to the topic and to illustrate their approach by researching a case of interest to them.

## **> PROFESSOR**

Gregoire Mallard Gregoire.mallard@graduateinstitute.ch

Office: MdP P1-531 Phone: +4122 908 44 62

## **Syllabus**

#### PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT

Students are required to read about 4-5 book chapters and articles per week. This course requires active participation from all members during class and every week. The assessment of students' performance will be broken down into four criteria: participation in class (10% of the grade), 1 short memorandum (10% each), a presentation in class (20%), and a final paper (60%). The short memorandum will consist in discussing the main concepts in *various articles/book chapters* among the

readings of the first part of the semester. During the second part of the semester, students will present their own research ideas in relation to other readings *during* class (max. 10 minutes). The final paper will consist in the analysis of an issue related to the field of expertise and globalization, which the readings in class help illuminate. It will involve some research with primary and/or second-hand documents: archives, interviews, observations, press analysis, academic works. It will not be longer than 25 double-spaced pages.

## PART 1 MAIN APPROACHES AND CONCEPTS

Each week, students are asked to read all the papers (except for the recommended readings, which are optional). Once during this 5-week period, they must write a 1-page memorandum in which they define the main concepts in at least 2 readings, and comment upon these concepts.

## WEEK 1 Cultures of Expertise: An Introduction (Sept 23)

- Gil Eyal, and Larissa Buchholz. "From the Sociology of Intellectuals to the Sociology of Interventions." *Annual Review of Sociology*, 36, 2010, p. 117-137.
- Camic, Charles, Neil Gross, and Michele Lamont (Eds.). 2011. *Social Knowledge in the Making*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press. (1-42; Introduction)

Recommended:

- Collins, H. M., and Robert Evans. 2002. "The Third Wave of Science Studies: Studies of Expertise and Experience." *Social Studies of Science* 32:235.
- Grégoire Mallard and Catherine Paradeise. 2008. "Global Science and National Sovereignty: A New Terrain for the Historical Sociology of Science." Pp. 1-39 in *Global Science and National Sovereignty*, edited by Grégoire Mallard, Catherine Paradeise and Ashveen Peerbaye. New York: Routledge.

#### WEEK 2 The (Social) Construction of Scientific Facts (Sept 30)

- Latour, Bruno, and Steve Woolgar. 1979. *Laboratory life: The social construction of scientific facts*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications. (15-41; 235-263; Chapters 1 and 6)
- Latour, Bruno. 1999. "Circulating Reference: Sampling the Soil in the Amazon Forest." Chapter 2 in *Pandora's Hope: Essays on the Reality of Science Studies*. Harvard University Press. pp. 24-79.
- Knorr Cetina, Karin. 1999. *Epistemic cultures: How the sciences make knowledge*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. (1-108; Chapters 1 through 4)

Recommended:

Latour, Bruno. 1987. *Science in action: How to follow scientists and engineers through society*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. (1-62, Introduction, Chapter 1)

- Latour, Bruno. 2002. Scientific Objects and Legal Objectivity. A chapter of *La Fabrique du droit* translated by Alain Pottage in *Law, Anthropology and the Constitution of the Social: Making Persons and Things*, Alain Pottage and Martha Mondy (editors), Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, pp.73-113, 2004.
- Pickering, Andrew. 1993. "The Mangle of Practice: Agency and Emergence in the Sociology of Science." *American Journal of Sociology*. 99:559-589.
- Hacking, Ian. 2000. *The Social Construction of What?* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. Chapter 1, "Why Ask That?" Pp. 1-35.
- Mallard, Grégoire. 2005. "Interpreters of the Literary Canon and Their Technical Instruments: The Case of Balzac Criticism." *American Sociological Review*. 70:992-1010.
- Latour, Bruno. 2004. "From Realpolitik to Dingpolitik or How to Make Things Public" In Bruno Latour & Peter Weibel. *Making Things Public Atmospheres of Democracy catalogue of the show at ZKM*, MIT Press, 2005. pp. 4-30.

#### WEEK 3 Professional Experts, Politicians and Boundary Work (Oct 7)

- Gieryn, T. F. 1983. "Boundary-Work and the Demarcation of Science from Non-Science Strains and Interests in Professional Ideologies of Scientists." *American Sociological Review* 48:781-795.
- Abbott, Andrew. 1988. The system of professions: An essay on the division of expert labor. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press. (33-87, Chapters 2 and 3)
- Jasanoff, Sheila. 1990. *The Fifth Branch*. Science Advisors as Policymakers. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. Chapters 1, 2, 3 and part of 4, Pp. 1-69.

#### Recommended:

- Hall, Peter A. 1989. Introduction to *The Political Power of Economic Ideas: Keynesianism across Nations*. Edited by Peter A. Hall. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Weir, Margaret and Theda Skocpol. 1985. "State Structures and the Possibilities for "Keynesian" Responses to the Great Depression in Sweden, Britain and the United States." In Peter Evans, Dietrich Rueschesmeyer, and Theda Skocpol, *Bringing the State Back In*. New York: Cambridge University Press. Pp.107-164.
- Star, Susan and James Griesemer.1989. "Institutional Ecology, Translations and Boundary Objects: Amateurs and Professionals in Berkeley's Museum of Vertebrate Zoology, 1907-39". *Social Studies of Science* 19 (3): 387–420.
- Lamont, Michèle, and Viràg Molnár. 2002. "The Study of Boundaries Across the Social Sciences." *Annual Review of Sociology* 28: 167-195.

#### WEEK 4 The Bourdieuian Approach to Fields of Expertise (Oct 14)

- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1987. "The Force of Law: Toward a Sociology of the Juridical Field." *Hastings Law Journal* 38:805–53.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1999. "The Social Conditions of the International Circulation of Ideas". In: Shusterman, Richard (ed.) Bourdieu: a Critical Reader. Oxford, UK: Blackwell Publishers. pp. 220-228.
- Dezalay, Yves and Bryant Garth. 2008. "National usages for a 'global' science: The dissemination of new economic paradigms as strategy for the reproduction of governing elites." Pp. 155-180 in

Global Science and National Sovereignty: Studies in Historical Sociology of Science, edited by Grégoire Mallard, Catherine Paradeise and Ashveen Peerbaye. New York: Routledge.

#### Recommended:

- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1990. *Homo Academicus*. Translated by P. Collier. Standford, CA: Stanford University Press., pp. xi-xxvi, 6-17, 36-72, 90-107.
- Dezalay, Yves, and Bryant Garth. 2002. "Chapter 1, 2, 3, 5. . Pp. 3-60, -98-140. In *The Internationalization of Palace Wars: Lawyers, Economists, and the Contest to Transform Latin American States*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Fourcade-Gourinchas, Marion. 2009. Economists and Societies. Princeton: Princeton University Press. "Introduction."
- Mudge, Stephanie L and Antoine Vauchez. 2012. "Building Europe on a Weak Field: Law, Economics and Scholarly Avatars in Transnational Politics." *American Journal of Sociology* 118, 2
- Medvetz Thomas. 2009. "Les think tanks aux États-Unis: L'émergence d'un sous-espace de production des savoirs." ["Think Tanks in the United States: The Emergence of a Subspace of Knowledge Production."] *Actes de la Recherche en Sciences Sociales* 176-177: 82-93.
- Go, Julian and Monika Krause. 2016. "Fielding Transnationalism: An Introduction." The Sociological Review 64(2):6-30.

## WEEK 5 Can Experts Shape Society? (Oct 21)

- Michel Foucault. 1995. Part 1, part of Chapter 1, "The body of the Condemned" Pp. 3-14; Part Three "Disciplines," part of Chapter 1, "Docile Bodies", Pp.135-146 + scan of pictures between pp.169-170; part of Chapter 2, "The Means of Correct Training", Pp.170-177, Chapter 3, "Panopticism" Pp.195-228. *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Scott, James C. 1998. Introduction Pp.1-8, and Chapters 3 and 4, Pp. 87-146. And Conclusion. *Seeing Like a State: How Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Latour, Bruno. 1993. *The Pasteurization of France*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. Introduction, Chapters 1 and 2.
- Davis, Kevin E., Benedict Kingsbury, Sally Engle Merry. 2012. "Indicators as a Technology of Global Governance." *Law and Society Review*. 46(1): 71-104

- Biernacki, Richard. 1995. *The Fabrication of Labor: Germany and Britain 1640-1914*. Berkeley, CA: Berkeley University Press. Chapters on the architecture of firms.
- Espeland, Wendy and Mitchell Stevens. 1998. "Commensuration as a Social Process. Annual Review of Sociology." 24:313-343
- Shapin, Steven and Simon Shaffer. 1989. *Leviathan and the Air-Pump: Hobbes, Boyle, and the Experimental Life*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

- Strathern, Marylin. 2000. *Audit Cultures: Anthropological Studies in Accountability, Ethics and the Academy*. London: Routledge.
- Foucault, Michel. 2003. Pp.46-73; Pp. 98-106; and Pp. 141-156 in *Society Must Be Defended: Lectures at the College de France*, 1975-76. Translated by David Macey. New York: Picador Editions.

#### **READING WEEK (Oct 28 no Class)**

# PART 2 THEMES AND TOPICS

Students must choose a week during which they will present their work and how it relates to specific themes covered in class.

## WEEK 6 Experts and Colonial Rule (Nov 4)

- Steinmetz, George. 2008. "The Colonial State as a Social Field: Ethnographic Capital and Native Policy in the German Overseas Empire Before 1914." *American Sociological Review*. 73(4): pp. 589–612.
- Mallard, Grégoire. 2019. *Gift Exchange: The Transnational History of a Political Idea*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Chapters 1, 2 and 4.
- Tucker, Karen. 2018. "Unraveling Coloniality in International Relations: Knowledge, Relationality, and Strategies for Engagement." *International Political Sociology*, 12(3): 215–232.

#### Recommended:

- Anderson, Benedict. 1983. "Preface of the Second Edition", Pp. xi-xv, "Introduction", pp.1-7; Chapter 7 "The Last Wave", Pp.113-141, Chapter 10, "Census, Map, Museum," Pp. 163-187. In *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. New York: Verso.
- Mitchell, Timothy. 2002, *Rule of Experts: Egypt, Techno-Politics, Modernity*, Berkeley, University of California Press. Introduction, Chapters 1 to 3, Pp. 1-119.
- Go, Julian. 2008. "Global Fields and Imperial Forms: Field Theory and the US and British Empires." Sociological Theory 26(3): 201-229.

## WEEK 7 From the Gender Critique of Experts to Gender Experts (Nov 11)

- Hekman, Susan. 1997. "Truth and Method: Feminist Standpoint Theory Revisited." Signs. 22(2): 341-365.
- Khan, S. 2005. Reconfiguring the Native Informant: Positionality in the Global Age. *Signs*. 30(4), New Feminist Approaches to Social Sciences.

- Merry, Sally Engle. 2006. *Human Rights and Gender Violence: Translating International Law into Local Justice*. Chicago: Chicago University Press. Chapters 1&2 on Culture in Human Rights Discourse
- Dersnah, Megan. 2019. "United Nations gender experts and the push to focus on conflict-related sexual violence." *European Journal of Politics and Gender*, 2(1):41-56(16)

#### Recommended

- Haraway, Donna. 1988. "Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Perspective." Feminist Studies. 14 (3): 575-599
- Hill Collins, Patricia. 1989. "The Social Construction of Black Feminist Thought." Signs 14(4): 745-773.
- Bereni, Laure and Eléonore Lépinard. 2004. "Les femmes ne sont pas une catégorie» les stratégies de légitimation de la parité en France." *Revue française de science politique*. 54(1): 71-98.
- Kunz, Rahel, and Elisabeth Prügl. 2019. "Introduction: Gender Experts and Gender Expertise." *European Journal of Politics and Gender* 2, no. 1 (February 2019): 3–21.
- Verschuur, Christine. « Je ne suis pas une experte en genre ». Colonialité des savoirs et troubles dans les rapports entre féminismes et « expertes en genre » en Colombie. Pp. 25-72. . Verschuur (dir.), *Qui sait ? Expertes en genre et connaissances féministes sur le développement*, Paris : L'Harmattan. Collection Genre et développement. <a href="https://books.openedition.org/iheid/7170">https://books.openedition.org/iheid/7170</a>

#### **WEEK 8** Experts and International Security (Nov 18)

- Cohn, Carol. 1987. "Sex and Death in the Rational World of Defense Intellectuals." Signs. 12(4): 687-705.
- Collier, Stephen, Andrew Lakoff, and Paul Rabinow. 2004. "Biosecurity: Towards an Anthropology of the Contemporary." *Anthropology Today* 20, no. 5: 3–7.
- Goede, Marieke de, Anna Leander, and Gavin Sullivan. 2016. "Introduction: The Politics of the List." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 34 (1):3–13.
- Severine Autessere. 2014. Introduction and Chapter 1. Pp. 1-58. *Peaceland : Conflict Resolution and the Everyday Politics of International Intervention*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Gusterson, Hugh. 1999. "Nuclear Weapons and the Other in the Western Imagination." Cultural Anthropology.14(1): 111-143
- Eyal, Gil. "Dangerous Liaisons between Military Intelligence and Middle Eastern Studies in Israel." *Theory and Society*, 31 (5), 2002, p. 653-693.
- Bigo, Didier. 2005. "La mondialisation de l'(in)sécurité ? Réflexions sur le champ des professionnels de la gestion des inquiétudes et analytique de la transnationalisation des processus d'(in)sécurisation." *Cultures et conflits*. 58: 53-101 [English version also available]
- Mallard, Grégoire and Andrew Lakoff. 2011. "How Claims to Know the Future are Used to Understand the Present: Techniques of Prospection in The Field of National Security." Pp. 339-377 in *Social Knowledge in the Making*, edited by Charles Camic, Michèle Lamont and Neil Gross. Chicago: Chicago University Press.

- Collier, Stephen and Andrew Lakoff. 2014. "Vital Systems Security: Reflexive Biopolitics and the Government of Emergency." *Theory, Culture and Society.* 32(2):19-51
- Stampnitzky, Lisa. 2013. Disciplining Terror: How Experts Invented Terrorism. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bhuta, Nehal. 2012. "Governmentalizing Sovereignty: Indexes of State Fragility and the Calculability of Political Order." In Kevin Davis, Angelina Fisher, Benedict Kingsbury, and Sally Engle Merry (ed.) *Governance by Indicators:*Global Power through Classification and Rankings. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Chapter 6: Pp. 132-162
- Zaloznaya, Marina and John Hagan. "Fighting Human Trafficking or Instituting Authoritarian Control?" In Kevin Davis, Angelina Fisher, Benedict Kingsbury, and Sally Engle Merry (ed.) 2012. *Governance by Indicators: Global Power through Classification and Rankings*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Chapter 14: Pp. 344-364
- Niederberger, Aurel. 2018. "Investigative ignorance in international investigations: how United Nations Panels of Experts create new relations of power by seeking information." *British Journal of Sociology*. 69(4): 984-1006.

## WEEK 9 Experts and Finance (Nov 25)

- Donald MacKenzie. 2011. "The Credit Crisis as a Problem in the Sociology of Knowledge," *American Journal of Sociology*. 16: 1778-1841.
- Riles, Annelise. 2010. "Collateral Expertise: Legal Knowledge in the Global Financial Markets." *Current Anthropology.* 51 (6): 795-818.
- Pierre Pénet and Grégoire Mallard. 2014. "From Risk Models to Loan Contracts: Austerity as the Continuation of Calculation by Other Means." *Journal of Critical Globalization Studies*. 7:4-50.
- Riles, Annelise. 2018. Financial Citizenship: Experts, Publics and the Politics of Central Banking. Cornell University Press. <a href="https://cornellopen.org/9781501732720/financial-citizenship/">https://cornellopen.org/9781501732720/financial-citizenship/</a>

- Flandreau, Marc. (ed) 2006. Money Doctors: The Experience of International Financial Advising. London: Routledge.
- Mirowski, Philip and Edward Nik-Khah. 2007. "Performativity and a Problem in Science Studies." Chapter 7 in Pp. 190-225. Do Economists Make Markets? On the Performativity of Economics, edited by Donald MacKenzie, Fabian Muniesa and Lucia Siu. Princeton: Princeton University Press
- Knorr Cetina, Karin. 2011. "Financial Analysis: Epistemic Profile of an Evaluative Science," Pp. 405-442 in *Social Knowledge in the Making*, edited by Camic, Charles, Neil Gross, and Michele Lamont. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press
- Halliday, Terence C., and Bruce G. Carruthers. 2007. "The Recursivity of Law: Global Norm Making and National Lawmaking in the Globalization of Corporate Insolvency Regimes." American Journal of Sociology 112(4):1135–1202.
- Halliday, Terence C. 2018. "Plausible folk theories: throwing veils of plausibility over zones of ignorance in global governance." British Journal of Sociology 69(4): 936-961.
- Ozgode, Onur. 2021. 2021, "The emergence of systemic risk: The Federal Reserve, bailouts, and monetary government at the limits." *Socio-Economic Review*, 1–31 doi: 10.1093/ser/mwaa053

## WEEK 10 Experts and Global health (Dec 2)

- Epstein, Steve. 1995. "The Construction of Lay Expertise: AIDS Activism and the Forging of Credibility in Clinical AIDS Trails." *Science, Technology and Human Values.* 20(4):408-437.
- Lakoff, Andrew. 2010. "Two Regimes of Global Health." *Humanity*: An *International Journal* of *Human Rights, Humanitarianism,*. and *Development*. 1(1), Fall 2010, pp. 59-79.
- Nguyen, Vinh-Kim. 2010. *The Republic of Therapy: Triage and Sovereignty in West Africa's Time of AIDS*. Duke University Press Books. Introduction and Chapter 1.
- Chorev, Nitsan. 2020. *Give and Take: Developmental Foreign Policy and the Pharmaceutical Industry in East Africa.* Chapters 1 and 2. Pp. 1-54.

#### Recommended:

- Lock, Margaret and Vinh-Kim Nguyen. 2010 *An Anthropology of Biomedicine*. Co-authored with Vinh-Kim Nguyen. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell. 2nd Edition, February 2018.
- Bharadwaj, Aditiya. 2012. Enculturating Cells: Anthropology, Substance, and Science of Stem Cells. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, Vol. 41, pp.303-17.
- Alberto Cambrosio, Pascale Bourret, Peter Keating and Nicole Nelson. 2017. "Opening the Regulatory Black Box of Clinical Cancer Research: Transnational Expertise Networks and 'Disruptive' Technologies." *Minerva*, 55(2) (161-185.
- Littoz-Monnet, Annabelle. 2017. "Expert Knowledge as a Strategic Resource: International Bureaucrats and the Shaping of Bioethical Standards." *International Studies Quarterly*, 61(3): 584–595.

## WEEK 11 Experts and the environment (Dec 9)

- Gaudillere, Jean-Paul and Pierre-Benoit Joly. 2008. "Appropriation and Regulation of Biotechnology Innovations: A Transatlantic Comparison," Pp. 168-194 in *Global Science and NationalSovereignty*, edited by Grégoire Mallard, Catherine Paradeise and Ashveen Peerbaye. New York: Routledge.
- Dahan, Amy. 2010. "Putting the Earth System in a numerical box? The evolution from climate modeling toward climate change", *Studies in History and Philosophy of Modern Physics*, 41 (282-292.
- Galvin, Shaila. 2018. "The Farming of Trust: Organic Certification and the Limits of Transparency in Uttarakhand, India." *American Ethnologist* 45 (4):495-507

- Latour, Bruno. 2004. Agency at the Time of Anthropocene. New Literary History 45:1-18.
- Espeland, Wendy N. 1998. *The struggle for water : politics, rationality, and identity in the American Southwest*. Chicago : University of Chicago Press.
- Gopalan Balachandran and Grégoire Mallard, with Olufunmilayo Arewa, Lucio Baccaro, Tim Büthe, Andrea Nightingale, Pierre Pénet, Dominique Pestre, Anthea Roberts. 2018. "Governing Capital, Labor and Nature

in a Changing World." Pp. 489-520 in Rethinking Society for the 21st Century: Report of the International Panel on Social Progress. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

## WEEK 13 Experts and ignorance (Dec 16)

- Proctor, Robert N. 2008. "Agnotology: A Missing Term to Describe the Cultural Production of Ignorance (and Its Study)." In *Agnotology: The Making and Unmaking of Ignorance*, edited by Robert N. Proctor and Londa Schiebinger, 1–37. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Oreskes, Naomi and Erik Conway. 2010. *Merchants of Doubt: How a Handful of Scientists Obscured the Truth on Issues from Tobacco Smoke to Global Warming*. New York: Bloomsberry Press. Introduction, Chapter 1, Conclusion, Epilogue.
- Mallard, Grégoire and Linsey McGoey. 2018. "Strategic Ignorance and Global Governance: An Ecumenical Approach to Epistemologies of Global Power." *British Journal of Sociology*. 69(4): 884-909.

#### Recommended

- Nadia Abu El-Haj. 2001. Facts on the Ground: Archaelogical Practice and Territorial Self-Fashioning in Israeli Society. Chicago: Chicago University Press. Chapters 1, 3, 6 and 7.
- Sullivan, Tuana. 2007, Introduction," in *Race and Epistemologies of Ignorance*, Albany, State University of New York Press, p. 1-10.
- Paul Connerton. 2008. "Seven Types of Forgetting." Memory Studies. 1:59-72.
- Mallard, Grégoire. 2014. Fallout: Nuclear Diplomacy in an Age of Global Fracture. Chicago: Chicago University Press. "Introduction and first Chapter."
- Mills, Charles. 2007. "White Ignorance," pp. 11-38 in *Race and Epistemologies of Ignorance*, edited by Shannon Sullivan & Nancy Tuana. Albany, NY: State Univ of New York.
- Pénet, Pierre. 2018. "The IMF failure that wasn't: risk ignorance during the European debt crisis." *British Journal of Sociology*. 69(4): 1031-1055.

## **END OF SEMESTER**